

Martha Nussbaum's Capabilities and Urban working poor women in Bangladesh

Shamsun Nahar Ahmed, Professor Zuo Ting

Humanities and Development Studies Department/China Agricultural University, Beijing, China

Abstract: *In order to contribute to the growing literature on women's empowerment in developing countries, this article presents a case study on a domestic worker in a Bangladeshi household. Using Martha Nussbaum's Capabilities Approach, it rejects the macroeconomic, GDP-based developmental paradigm that has entrenched poverty and class and gender divisions throughout the developing world. After presenting the case study, which examines the daily life of Tara, the article elucidates the policy prescriptions inherent to the problems she faces.*

Key words: *Bangladesh, Women, Capability Approach,*

I. Introduction

The following article aims to assess the quality of life of individual women in Bangladesh using Martha Nussbaum's capability list. It examines the life of a poor working class woman in Dhaka. The motivation behind the paper is Martha Nussbaum's recent publication "Creating Capabilities: The Human Development Approach" (2013) and an article by Peter Lloyd-Sherlock "Nussbaum, Capabilities and older people" published in *Journal of International Development* (2002). These authors have made a decisive break with traditional development perspectives.

Most studies on women's issues in Bangladesh focus on empowerment (Naila Kabeer et al.2011; Nazneen, S. et al. 2011;Schuler SR et al.2010), but few studies focus on the quality of life, which requires us to ask, 'what is she actually able to do?' As the central questions of the capability approach are qualitative, asking what urban poor working women are actually able to do and to be, it inherently sees her as a dignified human being who deserves the ability to shape her own life.

A recent report revealed that the Bangladesh Finance Ministry and Bangladesh Bank (BB) were having difficulty coming to a conclusion for the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) growth of the country. Their debate on growth rate is part of the inspiration for this article. The reports on GDP growth highlighted an important, unanswered question: how does this abstract figure relate to poor, urban working women? In what way does it affect their lives, and does GDP growth actually mean anything in terms of giving these women more capabilities? As mentioned by the news, GDP growth rate was partially based on future export target and external remittances, and this research found a linkage between these women and GDP growth. However, the Finance Ministry and BB do not explicitly mention how these citizens (who contribute to the GDP growth) earn a living, or examine their quality of life or their aspirations.

In "Creating Capabilities, a Human Development Approach," Martha Nussbaum, 2013 stressed that poor people around the world are struggling for meaningful lives that are worthy of their human dignity, but that leaders only focus on abstract issues like economic growth. From the above debate in Bangladesh on setting the growth rate, we see that our leaders do the same; they focus only on growth rate and not on its (ostensible) significance. In Bangladesh, it has long been known that increased GDP will not improve the quality of most people's lives if the extra resources earned are not used for public goods for the families of poor workers. Further, it is also true that the report of national achievements is not likely to do any good for a poor household because they lack literacy to read those reports or have access to those reports of country's achievements.

I am raising the issue of poor people because, as Mahbul Haq powerfully reminds us in UNDP's first Human Development Report, "The real wealth of a nation is its people. And the purpose of development is to create an enabling environment for people to enjoy long, healthy and creative lives. This simple but powerful truth is too often forgotten in the pursuit of material and financial wealth." Every year, the Human Development Report is published from UN headquarters and many countries publish their own domestic reports. Bangladesh also publishes its own Human Development Report, but there are still few public discussions about it, and debates do not focus on the quality of life of urban poor women who work as part-time house-maids, construction workers, garment factory workers, street vendors, cleaners, health workers etc.

What exactly is meant by quality of life? This paper looks at a variety of measures, including the condition and availability of housing, educational opportunities, the quality and availability of health care and pre-natal care, the quality and availability of child care services, and sanitation and nutritional conditions. It also places much importance on abstract measures such as quality free time and the ability to dream of a better life.

This article is based upon a case study of a female domestic worker in Dhaka and relies heavily, for its theoretical background, on the Human Development Approach, or the Capabilities Approach. This is a new theoretical approach in the development and policy world. It starts with very simple questions: What people are actually able to do and to be? What are the opportunities available to them?

II. The Capability Approach

The Capability approach was originally developed by Amartya Sen and has grown into an interdisciplinary framework of evaluation. Sen did not propose any definitive list or specify any capabilities to measure the quality of life of people. This has provoked two types of criticism. The stronger critique is Martha Nussbaum's claim that Sen should endorse one specific list of relevant capabilities. Martha Nussbaum lists ten central capabilities, which represent the bare minimum requirements of a human being to lead a life of dignity:

Basic capabilities: Basic capabilities are ones a person is born with, and are immutable. Internal capabilities: Internal capabilities are ones a person develops through life. Combined capabilities: Combined capabilities refer to the interplay of internal capabilities and the facilitation/Constraints of the external environment.

Nussbaum does not refer specifically to issues of agency and structure, but these are integral to her approach. Indeed, her 'combined capabilities' might be more effectively portrayed as an agent/structure interface. Like Sen, Nussbaum stresses the difference between capabilities and 'functionings'. The former is having the freedom to do or be something; the latter, whether or not this happens. People are usually in a position to choose between alternative functionings, and this will be influenced by their own particular values and preferences. It is generally accepted that capabilities are seen as more important than functionings.

The ten Central Capabilities as listed in her Capability Approach: Human Development Approach book of 2013.

1. Life: Being able to live to the end of a human life of normal length, not dying prematurely, or before one's life is so reduced as to be not worth living.
2. Bodily health: Being able to have good health, including reproductive health; to be adequately nourished; to have adequate shelter.
3. Bodily integrity: Being able to move freely from place to place; to be secure against violent assault, including sexual assault and domestic violence; having opportunities for sexual satisfaction and for choice in matters of reproduction.
4. Senses, imagination and thought: Being able to use the senses, to imagine, think and reason - and to do these things in a "truly human" way, a way informed and cultivated by an education, including, but by no means limited to, literacy and basic mathematics and scientific training; being able to use imagination and thought in connection with experiencing and producing works and events of one's own choices, religious, literary, musical, and so forth; being able to use one's mind in ways protected by guarantees of freedom of expression with respect to both political and artistic speech, and freedom of religious exercise; being able to have pleasurable experiences and to avoid non-beneficial pain.
5. Emotions: Being able to have attachments to things and people outside ourselves; to love those who love and care for us, to grieve, to experience longing, gratitude and justified anger. Not having one's emotional development blighted by fear and anxiety. (Supporting this capability means supporting forms of human association that can be shown to be crucial in their development.)
6. Practical reason: Being able to form a conception of the good and to engage in critical reflection about the planning of one's life. (This entails protection for the liberty of conscience and religious observance).
7. Affiliation: (A) Being able to live with and toward others, to recognize and show concern for other human beings, to engage in various forms of social interaction; to be able to imagine the situation of another. (Protecting this capability means protecting institutions that constitute and nourish such forms of affiliation, and also protecting the freedom of assembly and political speech). (B) Having the social bases of self-respect and non-humiliation; being able to be treated as a dignified being whose worth is equal to that of others. This entails provisions of nondiscrimination on the basis of race, sex, sexual orientation, ethnicity, caste, religion and national origin.
8. Other species: Being able to live with concern for and in relation to animals, plants, and the world of nature.
9. Play: Being able to laugh, to play and to enjoy recreational activities.
10. Control over one's environment: (A) Political: Being able to participate effectively in political choices that govern one's life; having the right of political participation, protections of free speech and association. (B) Material: Being able to hold property (both land and movable goods), and having property rights on an equal basis with others; having the right to seek employment on an equal basis with others; having the freedom from unwarranted search and seizure; in work, being able to work as a human being, exercising practical reasons and entering into meaningful relationships of mutual recognition with other workers.

III. Methodology

The article uses a real urban poor woman's life story and analyses the story within the framework of Nussbaum's capability list. As Robeyns (2005) points out, "Nussbaum's work... is much closer to traditions in the humanities, such as narrative approaches. Her work engages more with the power of narratives and poetic texts to better understand people's hopes, desires, aspirations, motivations and decisions."

The purpose of this examination is learning to use the capabilities list in assessing people's situation and promoting the idea of this development paradigm among policy makers and development practitioners'.

The article uses this life history method for gathering information. The life story of a young urban working woman is obtained after several days' interaction with her at her part-time work place where she works as domestic help. While reading Vasanti's analysis in Nussbaum's book, I located the woman and followed her for some days in her work place. This examination allows us to understand how useful Nussbaum's approach is for understanding the lives of urban working women in a developing country like Bangladesh, as her approach claims to be universal and replicable: The capabilities in question are important for each and every citizen, in each and every nation (Nussbaum 2000). In addition to life story analysis, the article presents several macroeconomic and development policies that could improve the quality of life for urban poor women.

IV. Context: Characteristics Urban Working Poor in Bangladesh

4.1 Who are the urban working poor?

Globally, the process of urbanization is increasing rapidly and it is estimated that the number of people living in urban areas will be more than 5 billion by 2025 (Schuler, 2004). With this increase, the number of poor in urban areas is also likely to rise. Bangladesh, with its high and growing population and rapidly increasing levels of urbanization, feels these trends most acutely. Urban working poor is here defined as those who have part-time and full time work but whose small incomes do not allow them to access better accommodation, health care, education etc. Dhaka, being the capital city, has the best health and educational facilities in the country, but many of the city's residents do not have the means to access them.

In the Bangladeshi context, most of the urban poor work as: Cleaners, Household garbage collectors, Domestic help, Vegetable vendors in the market, Construction workers, Transport workers, Factory workers, Day laborers, Rickshaw pullers etc. They are children, young boys and girls, married, unmarried and widowed women, young men, married and unmarried. They are the ones who keep the city clean, supply our food, build our houses, take us to our places of work, supply material goods home and abroad and make our life easy and livable in urban areas. But it is unfortunate that they are the people who do not have good accommodation, good food, good clothing, clean drinking water, good transport facilities, good health care etc. They play an enormously important role in keeping the city alive and kicking. However most of the urban well to do people do not realize and appreciate how these people contribute in running and moving the city economy forward.

4.2 Where do they come from and why do they come?

Most of the urban working poor migrate from the villages of poverty stricken districts of Bangladesh. The rural-urban migrations are the result of both 'push' and 'pull' factors. Factors pushing people from rural areas for alternative livelihoods in the town, and pull factors are easy employment and income earning in the towns compared to villages. The people who run our cities come from villages as villages provide only limited income generation opportunities for the whole family. Families migrate to city for many reasons, such as for income earning opportunities, loss in business, river erosion etc.

Female migration is increasing despite the constraints of women's dependent position within the family and society as households are in need of income, and more employment opportunities are available to women (UN 1995). Women migrate to cities due to bad marriages or as husbands are unable to run their livelihoods. Young girls migrate to city as domestic help and factory workers, sending remittances to help their parents to survive. It is also observed that presently young couples stay and work in the urban areas leaving behind young children in the villages with parents or other relatives. Basically all of them come to urban centres for their livelihood. The size of the urban households, according to Labour Force Survey 2010, is 4.3 persons. More than 50 percent of 'migrant populations' in the city were less than 35 years of age. Young populations predominate in urban centres because they are usually not yet integrated into rural traditional systems and they are more likely to leave the village than the older population (Opel, A. E.A, 1998).

4.3 How do they get to the work? What are the available means of transport?

Most of the urban working poor, both men and women, walk and/or use inadequate, poor transport services to go to their work places. Such inconvenient and limited transportation services hinder many women of working age population, and keep them out of employment.

According to a study (Debra, 2007) conducted by ADB on people's perception of their walking experiences in Dhaka city. The study highlighted that walking in Dhaka is often neither safe nor convenient. Present transportation environment that is more focused on cars than on people is not concerned with pedestrians. Most of the working poor in the city walk to their work places every day. Pedestrians are of vital importance to a city and yet, they face many obstacles to their safe, easy and convenient movement. Those problems cannot be adequately addressed without first giving pedestrians priority within urban and transport planning. Walking safely requires a safe walking space. In Bangladesh, pedestrians are the main victims of road accidents. In 2006, the Bangladesh Health and Injury Survey estimated there were approximately 13,200 reported road traffic deaths in the country and 403,000 injuries; 54% of the dead were pedestrians. In Dhaka, the proportion of road deaths that are pedestrians is even higher, at 86%.

4.4 Where and how do they live?

The urban poor usually stay in slums, rented rooms, makeshift shelters on rent-free land, sometimes even on the road sides/pavements. Some of them make their so-called houses at nights, using them only temporarily. Many sleep in the railway or bus stations or open spaces beside roads.

Data drawn from a 2009 Multiple Indicator Cluster Study (MICS) in Bangladesh clearly show that living conditions in urban slums are often appalling and, in fact, much worse than those in most rural areas (UNICEF report, 2010). Urban slums in Bangladesh grew much faster than the overall rate of urbanization. And although Bangladesh has made significant improvements in access to primary education, children living in urban slums remain the most disadvantaged.

In most cases, slums lack even the most basic amenities, such as running water, sewage systems, latrines, waste disposal services and electricity. Slum dwellers also have restricted access to basic social services, such as health clinics and schools.

A small proportion of the urban poor (20%) use sanitary latrines and the majority still use a variety of non-hygienic latrines. The study shows that 67% use electricity and another 33% still have no access to electricity. The study also found that 72% of the urban poor use traditional fuel for cooking and only 22% have access to gas facilities. More than 60% of the poor dump their garbage on the road or on the ground and a very small proportion (12.4%) of these poor households have access to the underground drainage system. Slum populations also have limited access to health and education. Though theoretically the urban poor have equal access to the public health facilities in the city, in reality very little is available to them. They are the most deprived groups in the city as they have very limited access to the existing educational opportunities. This is true for both primary education and general and technical education for adults. It has been evident from official statistics that although enrollment in primary school in urban areas is higher than that for rural areas, the enrollment of the slum population is very low.

4.5 Where do the children receive education from?

Compared to the rural areas, there are not many school facilities for the poorest segment of the children in the urban areas. Most families unable to send the children to school send their small boys to work in the hotels, restaurants, shops and garages. They are mostly deprived of proper education. According to a 2010 report by UNICEF Bangladesh, net secondary school attendance was 48% in rural areas and 53% in urban areas – but in slums, this number fell to 18%.

The discussion above shows that much of Bangladesh's population, especially in the slums of cities, lives in abject poverty with little to no social safety net. The following discussion aims to put a face to the numbers and statistics cited above. It will show how these numbers translate to human capabilities and what institutions are necessary for people to live minimally dignified, happy, and healthy lives. By going beyond positivist empirical data to case study analysis, this study aims to present a more comprehensive approach to development.

V. Case Story of Tara, the Fighter and the Breadwinner in the Family

The case story is based on our days of interactions. Her name is Tara(not her real name), a small woman in her early thirties who originally hailed from Pirgonj, Rangpur, a northern poverty stricken district, but has lived in Dhaka, the capital, since she was seven. Tara came to town with her aunts at the age of seven to work as a maid. Her family was unable to eat three meals a day as her father was not able to secure work each day. One of her aunts worked as maid and came alone to escape a bad marriage. Her husband was a singer and could not support the family, because of his meager income. Tara explained that because the community failed to supply them with the resources they could not acquire themselves, she felt the need to improve their situation and requested that her aunt take her into the city.

Presently her family pays rent for a room, which has electricity with one light and one fan. The house has tins (corrugated iron sheets) all around. There are forty similar houses in the complex filled to the brim with forty families taking up residence there. The housing arrangement offers them 10 stoves for the forty families, or one per four families. There are just two toilets for all the residents to use. The housing area lacks a bathing facility, so bathing has to be done in an open space. Some women of this complex work as part-time waste collectors or in the homes of others. Husbands work as rickshaw pullers or drivers. There were only six garment workers among these families.

Tara is now about 30 years old. She went back to the village and was married off at an early age – about thirteen – and then moved to town with her husband since they had little to eat in the village. During the last few years, she brought her old mother and blind father from the village. Since she married, she had been working part time. But her husband remarried so she left him to stay with her parents. Her daughter, only thirteen years old, has also been working as an operator in a garments factory for the last ten months in order to supplement her mother's income. She dislikes the work and wishes to quit but cannot because of the needs of her family. Though she completed four years of schooling, she could not continue her studies because of work. Now Tara is living with her daughter, mother, father and some relatives in the capital city.

Every day, Tara comes to work in the home of a rich family after walking for some time and then taking a minibus. The bus proves to be a problem as it is frequently overcrowded. She prefers to walk as it is cost-efficient, but even though she can save money, walking about an hour each way daily takes a toll on her body.

As Tara's dwelling has a dearth of cooking facilities, her mother must rise very early in the morning, around 3 am, to fetch water and cook for the whole family. Tara's two nieces, who are both minors, also stay with them. Her family of six stays in one room in the slum and pays Taka 3,000 (US\$ 37.5) as rent. Her monthly income is 3,500 (US\$ 43.75) while her daughter's is Taka 4,000 (US\$ 50). With the rising costs of food and transport, she is thinking of sending her mother to the village with her daughter, enabling her to resume her studies and work as a maid full-time.

Tara does not own any physical goods of her own. She had bought a few household goods on installment but it is becoming more and more difficult to pay the monthly installments. Due to her poor health, she also visits the doctor often and must purchase costly medicines and vitamins to improve her health even a little. Such life stories are very common among the urban poor in Dhaka and other cities and towns in the country (Ahmed, 2012).

VI. Analysis of the case story using Nussbaum's Capabilities List

Using the above capability list attempt is made to understand Tara's life and found the following:

Tara, born in a poorer family and living in others' houses, now suffering regularly from different diseases such as gastric, dysentery etc., has less probability to live a longer life. Seeing Tara, one can tell that she is not in good health and not adequately nourished. She does not have access to good housing facilities as she is living in a slum sharing with her parents to save her own income. Since she married early and gave birth to two children at young age, anybody can guess her reproductive health status. Overall she is not in a good health.

Since she works part time, she can move from place to place but now she has to cover herself so that she does not look like a street woman. She is no longer staying with her husband, she is not having sexual assault and domestic violence, but her marriage have put pressure on her emotional health. And living single at this age, she is deprived of sexual urge and satisfaction.

Being a child domestic worker, she did not have a chance for enjoying the benefit of schooling. Hence, her attitude, thinking, and imagination involve only her daughter's well being. She is deprived of reading novels, poetry etc. But with her money she can watch TV during her home stay with her family. Hence, her imagination is built upon TV programs.

She has her family with her so she can show her love to her parents and daughter. But she also shares her anxiety to her family through different activities such as even beating her pregnant girl due to her anger on her life. She is unable to plan to raise her own children better than her own life because she was not supported by the community, and she is not ready to take others' suggestions. She married off her daughter at the age of 12, like herself. Her part-time work allows her to live with her own family and help each other when needed.

Tara is deprived of living in a natural setting, as she is living in a slum established through encroaching the land by a big land grabber. Since childhood, she has lived in different places for survival only. For her, going back home from housework and staying with her pregnant daughter at night is the most enjoyable thing for her. She also enjoys watching drama serials during her home stay, though she has to walk every day two hours for going to work and back.

Tara does not have any land but they had a homestead back in the village which is enjoyed now by her brother. Hence, Tara did not have an equal claim to the land because in Bangladesh, women have half of what her brother would have regarding the land. She has the legal right to use, though not to own, this land.

If we summarize Tara's life situation it appears that she has less probability to live longer and healthy life because of the status of her health, which she inherits from her mother and not having enough nutrition during her growing age. She has the capability to move around, but she is deprived of sexual satisfaction. She said if she stayed outside home sometime, people think she is having sex outside, she said, "I can have sex like men do anywhere, but I think that is a shame or bad character."

Further, as she is illiterate she is deprived of reading, enjoying, and understanding the literary world around her. She shows her anger beating her daughter as she has no other option. She lives her life as she has affiliation with her parents and her daughter. This gives her energy everyday to come to work and work to improve her situation. Though she is living in others' houses or rented places, she does not own anything, but if she could stay in her village she could enjoy the nature better than slums, so she is deprived of natural settings. Her ability to watch TV in leisure time after her part time work is the most important event in her day. After work she goes back home everyday to enjoy time and sleep well with her family. Finally, Tara does not have any right to any property.

VII. Policy implication

Now, what would be the policy implications, if we want to improve the quality of life of Tara and women in similar situation, so that they can live a better life with dignity and flourish?

As Robeyns (2005) highlights,

Nussbaum enters the capability approach from a perspective of moral–legal–political philosophy, with the specific aim of arguing for political principles that a government should guarantee to all its citizens through its constitution. To perform this task, Nussbaum develops and argues for a well-defined but general list of 'central human capabilities' that should be incorporated in all constitutions. As such, her work on the capability approach is universalistic, as she argues all governments should endorse these capabilities.

What has Bangladesh done to address the problems underlined in the above case study? The Constitution of the People's Republic of Bangladesh (1972) outlines that the Government of Bangladesh is responsible for creating an environment that allows its citizens to improve the quality of their lives through access to health, education, and other basic services. Despite this declaration and Dhaka's huge growth, Bangladesh has no explicit or comprehensive policy on urbanization and urban poverty. (Barrett A. Dunn K, 2006).

The National Health Policy began with a slogan "Good health is the tool for Development," and according to the Constitution's Article 15(a), the state is responsible for providing basic needs of the people including health care services. Article 18(1) maintains that ensuring health services, improving nutrition status, and improving health are integral tasks of the state. There are nineteen goals and sixteen principles included in the document, two of which ensure that health services for poor and vulnerable people are provided. However, in the challenges section which includes nineteen challenges, the eighth of these focus on urban health services. It states that poor people, especially those that live in slums, are generally deprived of health services because of inadequate facilities with low capacity to deliver services, and the high price. Therefore it is evident that there is a problem in the health services for poor in urban areas. It is also noticed from Tara's life that she goes to the pharmacy for health services. 'Pharmacies were the most dominant health care source in both urban slums of Dhaka and rural areas' also confirmed by an empirical research in slum of Dhaka (Khan et al.2012). Further, in Bangladesh 43 percent of the population is under-15. However, there is no specific health policy to address this age group among poor in urban areas.

It is also evident, by reviewing the housing policy for urban poor that the National Housing Policy, in place since 1993, focuses only on urban government employees and urban middle class people. In an attempt to draw population back to villages from Dhaka, the government instituted a village housing assistance program. However, with almost no employment opportunities in the villages, the program has had little impact (Rashid.2007).

As per the Constitution, Bangladesh has an obligation to ensure basic education for all, and the state has a responsibility to ensure primary education for all in National Education Policy of 2010. It also has plans to extend primary education from 5 years to 8 years. Presently five years education is free for all in public schools and there is a stipend provided to girls to increase female participation in primary school in rural areas. It started in 1992 but Tara could not avail this service. However, her daughter could study until class IV in the village where the stipend policy is implemented. Hence, it reveals that education policy did work for Tara's daughter but for poverty and also security of girls, her daughter's schooling had to be discontinued she was married off at the age of puberty at 12.

An appraisal of Dhaka's urban transport project, financed by the World Bank, reveals that there is an "absence of a good scheduled bus system (or other mass transport), most buses being old, overcrowded and generally inaccessible to women passengers; and poor accessibility for women to existing bus services due to overcrowding and inadequate sidewalks and pedestrian facilities which constrain poor garment workers who walk to work in large numbers (Zohir, 2003)". Currently, there are only five buses catering to women, but Tara is unable to take the ride as it is not close to her home. Other evidence shows that the project and policy do not assist the poor. The city's primary concern is building expressways to relieve urban-suburban congestion. These projects are primarily meant to appease the ever-growing car-owning population of the city, a much wealthier demographic. Tara will never be able use such an expressway so it does not improve her well being.

Finally, Article 27 of the Constitution mandates that all citizens are equal before the law and are entitled to equal protection from it. The government is there to protect each citizen from insecurity. But in case of Tara, she has to encourage her daughter to marry at twelve because she cannot ensure her safety without a husband.

It is apparent that the Constitution of Bangladesh articulates that the government must ensure the quality of life of its citizens. Hence, Nussbaum's principles are present, but the policies have thus far been completely ineffective.

Following Nussbaum's capabilities, we cannot change anything of her "basic capabilities," which she inherited during her prenatal stage. But we could improve her internal capabilities if she could attend some adult schooling in her community, which is absent. We could change her life if we could provide a her housing facility with better toilet and shower which would help her stay healthy and save money from her income for eating better. Now she and her family spend big amounts of money for the slum room only with a light and a fan without toilet and shower facility.

But we know from reading in newspapers that there are a lot of housing facilities in Dhaka, as there are many unrented flats. But when considering housing for Tara, which means Tara may not access these empty housing facilities because she does not have money to buy or rent those. She will never be able to buy those in her life even any member of her family will not be able to, hence, there should be a policy from the part of the state to provide good housing for her. The present urban projects are focused on construction of drains and roads not any housing facility for poor urban people.

It is similar with transport. In Dhaka, there are horrific traffic jams since the number of vehicles on the road has increased so dramatically. This increase in traffic has greatly reduced Tara's functioning. With her little money, she can only afford the most dangerous modes of transport, and must wait hours in traffic if she decides not to walk. To save the money and also hassle of sitting with too many people, she walks every day.

VIII. Conclusion

This essay provides an empirical evidence of life of an urban woman. It takes an effort to examine the life of an urban poor working woman using Nussbaum's capability approach. The different aspects of Tara's position interact with one another in complex ways, but each issue is also a distinct issue that must be addressed separately.

A decent urban, as well as national, public policy can influence all areas of her experience. It finds that Tara is deprived of many things from the list, including good health as she suffering from different diseases which reduce her life's longevity, she is living but not living healthily. She always has to think how to stay well to work for her survival because if she stays home, no one will feed her. Her span of planning for her life is very short. She is deprived of good and subsidized transportation facility for which she walks one hour with her ill health to avoid harassment and also save money. She is unable to articulate and demand all the requirements from the government, but Nussbaum explains her work on capabilities as providing citizens with a justification and arguments for constitutional principles that citizens have a right to demand from their governments (Nussbaum, 2013). There should be more discussion about women's issues in Bangladesh. I found that women write most of articles on women. From this issue, it appears that men do not think about women issues much, hence, we women have to come forward more to write about the issues of women and work more to realize their needs.

References

- [1] Nussbaum, C. Martha, *Creating Capabilities: The Human Development Approach* (The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts and London, England. 2013)
- [2] Lloyd, Sherlock, Nussbaum Capabilities and Older People, *Journal of International Development, Int. Dev.* 14, 1163–1173 (2002) Published online in Wiley Inter Science DOI: 10.1002/jid.958
- [3] Naila Kabeer, Simeen Mahmud and SakibaTasneem. "Does Paid Work Provide a Pathway to Women Empowerment?" IDS Working Paper Volume Number 375. Institute of Development Studies, 2011.
- [4] Nazneen, S. Maheen Sultan and Naomi Hossain. "National Discourse on Women's Empowerment in Bangladesh: Enabling or Restricting Women's Choices?" IDS/Pathways of Women Empowerment Research Program Consortium Working Paper. Brighton: Institute of Development Studies, 2011.

- [5] Schuler SR, Islam F, Rottach E., Women's empowerment revisited: a case study from Bangladesh. *Dev Pract.* 2010 Sep 1;20(7):840-854.
- [6] Human Development Report, 1999
- [7] Judy Baker and Nina Schuler, 2004. A Summary of Methods and Approaches, retrieved from <http://elibrary.worldbank.org/content/workingpaper/10.1596/1813-9450-3399> DOI: 10.1596/1813-9450-3399.
- [8] UN 1995. The Human Development Report 1995, United Nations Development Program (UNDP) (New York Oxford, Oxford University Press 1995)
- [9] Opel, A. E.A., 'Livelihood of the Vulnerable: An Ethnographic Illustration of Life in Dhaka Slums', Urban Livelihood Monograph-2 (Dhaka: Proshika, 1998)
- [10] Efrogmson, Debra. Moving Dangerously, Moving Pleasurably: Improving Walk ability in Dhaka. (Rep. Dhaka: Asian Development Bank, 2007)
- [11] UNICEF (2010). Understanding Urban Inequalities in Bangladesh: A prerequisite for achieving Vision 2021 (Dhaka: UNICEF 2010)
- [12] Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey
- [13] Robeyns, Ingrid. The Capability Approach: a theoretical survey, *Journal of Human Development* Vol. 6, No. 1, March 2005
- [14] Nusubaum, Martha, *Women and Human Development: The Capability Approach* (Cambridge University Press, and Cambridge 2000)
- [15] Barrett A. Dunn K. Reaching the MDGs in urban Bangladesh. World Bank Workshop: Towards a Strategy for Achieving MDG Outcomes in Bangladesh. Session 5: Challenges facing the urban poor, Dhaka. 6 June 2006. p. 15.
- [16] Khan, M.M.H., Grübner, Oliver, Alexander Krämer, Frequently used healthcare services in urban slums of Dhaka and adjacent rural areas and their determinants, *Journal Public Health* (2012) 34 (2): 261-271.doi: 10.1093/pubmed/fdr108 First published online: January 12, 2012
- [17] Rashid, S. Faiz, Strategies to reduce exclusion among population living in urban slum settlements in Bangladesh, *J Health PopulNutr.* Aug 2009; 27(4): 574-586.
- [18] Zohir, S. Chowdhury. Integrating gender into World Bank Finance Transport Programs: Case Study Bangladesh Dhaka Urban Transport Project, 2003, World Bank. <http://www4.worldbank.org/afr/ssatp/resources/html/gender-rg/Source%20%20documents/case%20studies/ICNET%20Case%20Studies%20for%20WB/CSICN5%20BangladeshThirdRural.pdf>