

Implementation of Competency-Based Curriculum Policy at Tourism Polytechnic of Makassar

Wim Johannes Winowatan¹, Rifdan², Anshari³, Fakhir Kahar⁴

¹(Doctoral students at Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia)

²(Lecturer at universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia)

³(Lecturer at universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia)

⁴(Lecturer at universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia)

Corresponding Author: Wim Johannes Winowatan

Abstract: The objective of this study was to examine and analyze the implementation of competency-based curriculum policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic and factors supporting and inhibiting the implementation of competency-based curriculum at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic. This study is a qualitative research with case study method. Techniques of data collection in this study include in-depth interviews and document study. The results of this study indicate that the implementation of CBC policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic generally has been running well although it is not yet optimal, based on the results of the interviews, because there are still obstacles causing the learning process to not run optimally in accordance with the implementation of CBC policy, as set forth in the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism number 6 of 2017 concerning Competency-Based Curriculum, due to factors supporting and inhibiting the implementation of the policy.

Keywords: Curriculum, Lecturer, Policy, Regulation of the Minister of Tourism number 6 of 2017 on Competency-Based Curriculum, Students

Date of Submission: 26-01-2018

Date of acceptance: 15-02-2018

I. INTRODUCTION

Education is an absolute requirement to build a nation. The development of national education refers to promoting the intellectual life of the nation and enhancing the quality of educated human resources in the face of global competition. In this case, human resources are encouraged to be competent in accordance with their educational level or background, as well as confident in disseminating their educational discipline as an implementation of the improvement of the quality of human resources as stated in the Law of the Republic of Indonesia number 12 of 2012^[1] concerning Higher Education in Chapter I Article 1 Paragraph 2, which explains that higher education is a conscious and planned effort to create a learning atmosphere and learning process that can encourage students to actively develop their potential to have spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character, and skills they need to contribute to the society, nation, and country. Higher Education is based on: scientific truth; honesty; justice; benefits; virtue, responsibility, diversity; and affordability. Furthermore, based on the Ministry of National Education Decree number 232/U/2000 on Guidelines for the Formulation of Higher Education Curriculum and Assessment of Student Learning Outcomes, especially in Article 7 Paragraph 1, the structure of the higher education curriculum consists of core and institutional curriculum. Meanwhile, in Article 8 Paragraph, it is divided into 5 groups of courses, namely (1). Personality Development Courses (MPK), (2) Sciences and Skills Courses (MKB), (3). Work Skills Courses (MKB), (4). Work Behavior Courses (MPB), and, (5) Social Life Courses (MBB). These five elements are the characteristics of today's higher education institutions.

Makassar Tourism Polytechnic, which is one of the higher education institutions, is responsible for the achievement of national education objectives through the functions of higher education as mentioned before, and by referring to Law Number 12 of 2012^[1] on Higher Education and Regulation of the Minister of Tourism No. 3 of 2016^[2] on Makassar Tourism Polytechnic STATUTE in Article 1 Paragraph 2, which explains that Makassar Tourism Polytechnic STATUTE, hereinafter called STATUTE, is a basic guidance of organizing activities used as a basis for organizing and developing programs and activities in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic.

Development of CBC focuses on certain competencies that are a combination of knowledge, skills and attitudes that must be possessed by each learner as a form of understanding of the concepts learned in accordance with the demands of CBC. From this reference, to answer the need for a professional and competent

tourism workforce, the Ministry of Tourism has conducted a review or re-evaluation of curriculum and has established it in the use of CBC through the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism number 6 of 2017 which furthermore must be implemented for higher education of tourism, especially technical implementation unit (UPT) of Makassar Tourism Polytechnic. This is because the use of Curriculum in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic is in line with Law number 12 of 2012^[1] on Higher Education.

The implementation of a policy certainly cannot be separated from several considerations, including readiness of planning, readiness of resources, readiness of facilities and infrastructure, as well as of supporting facilities. This can be measured through two factors that are at the same time questions in designing a policy to be implemented, namely what are the supporting factors and inhibiting factors? (Edward III George Charles, 1984[3] Public Policy Implementation JAI Press editor). Both of these questions should be the main consideration in designing and implementing a policy so that the results can be evaluated for revision or reconsideration to formulate a new policy.

The results of the preliminary observation at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic reveal that there is no vertical and horizontal communication within Makassar Tourism Polytechnic regarding the enactment of the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism number 6 of 2017^[4] on Competency-Based Curriculum, causing the delay of communication for lecturers in teaching certain courses, the unpreparedness of lecturers in preparing or making Syllabus and Lesson Plan, the limited number of lecturers available in each study program because some lecturers are transferred, the number of students received to exceed the available classes and seat capacity, the delay in the procurement of practice materials and lab maintenance, the absence of library for certain study programs in addition to the student library, and the limited number of administration staff in certain study programs and practice labs. Based on the above explanation, the problem formulated was: How is the implementation of competency-based curriculum policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic?

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Curriculum Theory

Law number 20 of 2003^[5] on National Education System Article 1 Paragraph 19 states that curriculum is a set of plans and regulations concerning lesson content and materials and methods used as the guidelines for the implementation of learning activities to achieve certain educational goals. In Article 36 Paragraph 3, it is mentioned that curriculum is developed in accordance with level and type of education, which is also stated in the Law of the Republic of Indonesia number 12 of 2012^[1] on Higher Education.

Mulyasa (2006)^[6] in his book "Competency Based Curriculum" explains that there are at least six characteristics of Competency Based Curriculum, namely (1) Learning System by using Modules. (2). Using all Learning Resources. (3), Providing Field Experience. (4) Providing Individual Personal Learning Strategy. (5). Ease of Learning, and (6) Mastery Learning.

In relation to the Theory or the concept of Competency-Based Curriculum (CBC), competence is the ability to do something, which is different from just knowing something. Competence must be demonstrated in accordance with the standards in employment (Hamalik, 2000)^[7]. CBC is oriented to conditions in which students not only understand the subject matter to develop their intellectual ability, but rather to how the knowledge that has been understood can develop the behaviors displayed under real-life situations.

The characteristics of Competency-Based Curriculum (CBC) by MoNE (2002) include: Emphasizing the competency achievement both individually and classically and containing a number of competencies to be achieved by the students and these competencies serve as minimum or basic standards, Learning-oriented and diversity-oriented, meaning that the success of achieving basic competencies is measured by indicators of learning outcomes. These indicators are the benchmarks of the expected competencies.

B. Public Policy Theory

Public policy is an applied science (Freeman, 2006)^[8]. Public policy by experts is defined in various ways. It is influenced by the various interests underlying its formulation. Thoha (2012) provides an interpretation of public policy that it is a result of the formulation of a government.

The implementation of public policy is a series of activities after a policy, Ramdhani & Ramdhani Jurnal Publik Vol. 11; No. 01; 2017; 1-12 4, is formulated and defined. Policy implementation refers to the mechanisms, resources, and relationships associated with the implementation of policy programs (Mthethwa, 2012)^[9]. Without its implementation, an established policy will not be successful.

The success of policy implementation requires stakeholders to get involved democratically and participatively. Stakeholders and policymakers must continue to engage in dialogue to analyze the consequences of implementing the policy. Therefore, evaluation of the implementation of the policy needs to be done to see the accountability and performance improvement of a public policy. Helmut Wollman's model divides the evaluation of policy implementation into three main types: ex-ante evaluation, on-going evaluation, and ex-post evaluation (Lintjewas, Tulusana, & Egetan, 2016)^[10].

C. Implementation Theory

Cleaves (quoted in Wahab 2008: 187)^[11] explicitly states that Implementation includes "The process of moving towards policy goals through administrative and political steps". The success or failure of the implementation can thus be evaluated in terms of its real ability to continue or operationalize the programs previously designed. According to Mazmanian and Sabatier (in Wahab, 2001: 68)^[11], the meaning of policy implementation is that the implementer of basic policy decisions is usually in the form of law.

The theory of Policy Implementation by George C. Edward III proposes an approach to policy implementation by first raising two key questions: what are factors supporting successful implementation of policy? what are factors inhibiting successful implementation of policy?

Based on these two questions, four factors are formulated which are the main requirements of successful implementation process, namely communication, resources, bureaucratic or implementer attitude, and organizational structure, including workflow bureaucracy. These four factors become important criteria in the implementation of a policy. Edward III in Juliartha (2009: 58)^[12] asserts that the main problem of public administration is the lack of attention to implementation that without effective implementation the decision of policymakers will not be carried out successfully. Communication is concerned with how the policy is communicated to the organization and/or to the public, with the availability of resources to implement the policies, with attitudes and responses of the parties involved, and with the organizational structure of policy implementation as described by Haedar Akib in the *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Publik* Volume 1 No . 1/February 2010 on policy implementation. Furthermore, Edward III (1984)^[3] puts forward influential factors in the implementation as follows; (1) Communication, (2) Resources, (3). Disposition, and (4). Bureaucratic structure. Furthermore, Edward III briefly explains that inaccurate, unclear or inconsistent guidelines will give the implementers a chance to use discretion.

III. RESEARCH METHOD

A. Approach, Research Design and Source of Data

The approach used in this research is naturalistic qualitative approach because this research was conducted in natural setting, with case study method. According to Aziz S.R. (2003)^[13], the basic concept of a case study is a detailed research of a person (individual) or a social unit over a period of time, called a case study. Qualitative approach in this study was chosen because the object of this research was the process of activities or actions of some people about the implementation of Competency-Based Curriculum policy.

The data collected in this research do not only include the events or processes that occur in the present, but also in the past that might be related to each other. This approach was chosen in the hope that the researcher can reveal more in depth answers to the problems that are the focus of this research. Meanwhile, the type of this research is qualitative descriptive research, which is addressed to investigate the implementation of Competency-Based Curriculum Policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic.

The data sources of this research are as follows:

1. Primary Data

According to Lofland in Moleong (2010: 157)^[14], the main data sources in qualitative research are words and actions. Words and actions are sources of data obtained from the field by observing and interviewing. Before the interview, the researcher conducted an observation to get information about the condition of the research location. The researcher prioritized this data to obtain information directly on the implementation of Competency-Based Curriculum Policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic.

2. Secondary Data

Secondary data refers to data obtained from reading sources and various other sources consisting of letters or office memo, daily notes, learning activities, or documents and information from related parties on the issues studied, such as documents in the form of Laws, Government Regulations, Ministerial Regulations and other documents relating to the implementation of Competency-Based Curriculum policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic.

3. Informants

Sources of data in this study are humans and things or objects. According to Miles and huberman (2007)^[15], data sources in qualitative research are humans and things or objects. Informants as a source of data in this research are those who are directly related to the research and who understand the situation and conditions to be studied. The data in this study is data collected from informants that include the academic department staff, heads of study program, lecturers, educators, and students.

B. Research Focus and Instrument

The focus of this research is to find out the extent to which competency-based curriculum policy is implemented at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic, which includes; (1). Identifying the implementation of competency-based curriculum policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic (2). Analyzing Factors Supporting and Inhibiting the Implementation of the competency-based curriculum policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic and, (3). Drawing conclusions from the results of the analysis and providing recommendations. Meanwhile, the instrument used in this research is an interview guide.

C. Techniques of Data Collection and Validation

Data collection techniques used in this study are as follows:

1. Interview

Interviews are conversations with a specific purpose. Conversations are made by two parties, namely the interviewer and the interviewee. According to Lincon and Moleong (2010: 135), interviews intend to explore people, events, activities, feelings, and others.

Interviews were done by providing questions to be answered directly by selected informants to provide information relevant to problems studied. According to Supardi (2006), Interview Method is a question and answer process done orally in a research, in which two or more people get involved in a face-to-face interaction to extract information.

2. Document Study

Document study is the collection of data by reviewing literature, which includes documents that are considered to support and relevant to the problems studied, whether in the form of reports, laws, government regulations, ministerial regulations, and others related to the research.

The researcher collected data in the form of official documents that existed in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic. Meanwhile, the data validation was done through qualitative method with technique of data source triangulation (Moleong, 2000). To obtain information on the level of data validity, the researcher used triangulation, which was to make comparison between data sources. As Moleong (2000) points out that "Triangulation is a technique of verifying the validity of data that utilizes something excluding the data for the purpose of checking or as a comparison to that data. The collected data consists of field notes, comments, pictures, photos, documents and so on. Validation was done to increase the degree of confidence in the validity of the data. The validity of the data can be achieved if it meets the 4 (four) criteria, including, (1). Credibility, used to carry out a research in such a way that the level of confidence in the findings can be achieved. (2). transferability, used to carry out a research in such a way that a degree of confidence in the findings can be achieved. (3). dependability, confronting one data with another data. If the result remains the same, it can be assumed that reliability is achieved, and, (4). Conformability, meaning that something objective is something reliable.

D. Technique of Data Analysis

Data analysis technique used is qualitative descriptive analysis, while the data analysis process used is the interactive model of Miles and Hiberman (in Faisal, 2001: 256), which includes:

1. Data collection, done after drawing conclusions based on problems and research objectives to obtain propositions, statements or resumes as research findings that can be generally accepted.
2. Data reduction, done for the sake of simplification of data in order to sharpen the required data.
3. Data display, done in an organized and systematic manner so as to form a component that is intact and integrated.
4. Conclusion drawing, done to verify data obtained to find out meaning, to record the regularity of the pattern of causal relationships that might serve as a very loose and open conclusion, and to draw a final conclusion.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The educational process undertaken is based on programs and activities that are systematically arranged to produce graduates that meet market demands while focusing on quality, competence, competitiveness and professionalism.

Makassar Tourism Polytechnic is a working unit of the Ministry of Tourism, which is under the guidance of Deputy Tourism Resources Development. As a government-owned higher education institution, Makassar Tourism Polytechnic currently has educational facilities and infrastructures. They include 23 rooms, 11 of which are used for department office, study program office, library, computer laboratory, language laboratory, MDK laboratory (Fidelio), MUP laboratory (abacus), Kitchen and Restaurant, TUK room (Place for Competency Test), health clinic room, library building, dormitory for students, and supporting facilities for learning process. Thus, facilities and infrastructures are available until now and it can be concluded that

Makassar Tourism Polytechnic has been in accordance with standards and representative. Meanwhile, the curriculum applied in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic is based on the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism number 6 of 2017 on Competency-Based Curriculum.

The main components of the implementation of Competency Based Curriculum policy at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic are included in the four core frameworks of the basic components of curriculum as follows:

1. Learning Process (Theory and Practice)

It contains key ideas about learning and teaching to achieve established competencies, as well as pedagogical and analogical ideas that manage learning to be non-mechanistic.

2. Work Practice Process (Practice in Industries)

It contains learning concepts for learners through direct work experience in industries. At this stage, learners are given the opportunity or time to do the learning process through actual work practices in industries (Observing the reality and comparing the theory concepts in the learning process that has been obtained).

3. Assessment of learning outcomes in the middle and at end of semester

This assessment process emphasizes the process of enabling students to explore their abilities optimally, in contrast to the assessment that focuses solely on the content of the learning process that has been obtained. The assessment process is done twice in; in the middle of semester and at the end of semester.

4. Competency Test Process

Learners are faced with the process of competency test. This process can be followed by the learners if they have been through and passed the assessment process in middle and at the end of semester. At this stage, learners are tested by the professional certification institute to evaluate, assess and decide at the end of the assessment whether the learners are competent or incompetent in their field according to the given learning materials.

Based on the above explanation about the mechanism of learning activities, from planning to the end of implementation, the data in this research is presented with the narration of the results of data collection, either through interviews or through the document study. The presentation of Competency-Based Curriculum Policy Implementation at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic is as follows:

The results of the interview is based on qualitative analysis of the question and answer process conducted with the informants determined by the researcher with the concept of ten questions on the first research problem, namely How is the Implementation of the Competency-Based Curriculum Policy in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic?. Interview questions were answered by informants with "yes" and "no" and they were given opportunity to comment on questions asked to them. Data obtained from interviews are written in the table of interview results. Moreover, the answer of each question was reviewed by the researcher, especially the comments given by the informants.

The data of interview result 1 is the result of interview with the students, which was given the code M1-M8 and named Professional 1 during the analysis. The interview result data describes the change of understanding, unawareness of CBC and its implementation even though there were informants who quite understood the CBC and its implementation. In addition, an observation was conducted on honesty of answers and comments given (based on the consideration of the answers assessed by the researcher), doubt, satisfaction, constructive suggestions, and appreciation of CBC policy implementation.

The data of interview result 2 is the result of interview with the lecturers and the administration staff and coded D1-D5 and named Professional 2. In contrast to interview 1, interview result 2 illustrates good understanding of CBC and its implementation, honesty and dishonesty (based on the consideration of the answers assessed by the researcher), doubt, and dissatisfaction in the process. In addition, there were constructive suggestions and appreciation of CBC policy implementation. The expressions of the informants include: Definitely understand/I know the CBC, the practice materials have been provided, the lecturer is "lazy", and others. All of the inputs were documented and greatly assisted the researcher in interpreting the issues of implementation of the CBC policy. The data that has been described is quite political (based on the consideration of understanding by the researcher).

1. Document Study Results

Documents studied are documents pertaining to the first research problem and are very important in generating the conclusions of this research. The documents in question are; laws, ministerial regulations, the opinions of researchers on the Competency-Based Curriculum, as well as the existing Policy Studies delivered in accordance with the researcher's perspective.

Implementation of competency-based curriculum policy through the implementation of teaching and learning process at Makassar Tourism Polytechnic can be analyzed or concluded as follows:

The implementation is emphasized on the competency achievement of students performed individually or in groups according to the learning materials. In general, it runs well according to the learning objectives.

Implementation of teaching and learning process is oriented to learning outcomes and in accordance with competency test materials (MUK) provided. However, the implementation has not been maximized due to limited human resources such as lecturers of certain courses, and because some courses do not refer to syllabus and Lesson Plan because some lecturers do not make or not prepare them before they teach. With reference to the delay in the information given to the lecturers, they are sometimes slow in preparing syllabus and lesson plan for the courses they are responsible for. Information delays occur due to lack of coordination. This is an obstacle to communication. As for the implementation of the learning process, varied methods are used. This includes direct demonstration of learning materials given by the lecturers to students that runs well in accordance with the learning objectives.

Learning resources are not only teachers or lecturers, but other things that have educational elements such as the use of group learning methods and learning to solve problems either by teachers or lecturers and students. This is done both theoretically and practically in the practice laboratory.

In the process of teaching and learning, students are given competence materials in accordance with their field by using facilities and infrastructure and supporting learning facilities, as well as materials prepared by the management of Makassar Tourism Polytechnic. Learning method applied is learning by doing. Teachers or lecturers function as facilitators or mentors. Question and answer method is done directly by providing opportunities for students to learn independently and practice learning. However, this method of learning, especially practical learning done in the practice lab, sometimes does not run optimally. This is caused by some facilities and infrastructure that cannot function properly and lack of supporting facilities.

The assessment emphasizes the process and outcomes in the effort of mastering or achieving a competency, which includes testing theory and direct practice through demonstration. Teachers or lecturers function as facilitators and assessors (examiners).

After measuring and assessing the final results of the students' ability to receive learning materials that have been given, there will be the final stage in which students who have passed the final assessment will be through the final test in the form of a competency test conducted by the certification institute and the testers are not teachers or lecturers but assessment teams (assessors). The final test results will indicate whether the students are competent or incompetent. If students are declared incompetent, they will be given the opportunity to be retested.

Furthermore, for the data from interview result 2, the first thing to be considered is the conclusion of data analysis to draw conclusion 2: How is the implementation of CBC in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic?; "The implementation of the CBC policy is well under way, but there are obstacles in the preparation of syllabus and lesson plan, and the time allotment for theory and practice is not in accordance with the implementation of CBC, although in the process it is understood that CBC is a combination of knowledge, attitudes and behaviors that require the implementation of CBC to run well".

From the analysis of interview data 1 and 2 and/or professional data 1 and 2, it can be concluded that:

a. The CBC policy in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic has generally been implemented well, based on interview result, although it is not yet optimal because there are still obstacles that result in the learning process not in accordance with the policy of CBC implementation as regulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism number 6 of 2017 on Competency-Based Curriculum on Higher Education within the Ministry of Tourism. For example, there are still lecturers who do not make syllabus and lesson plan on the grounds that information on courses they are responsible for takes much time to be delivered to them by the academic department. In addition, they are slow to prepare the practice materials and do not pay much attention to the condition of facilities and infrastructure that might influence the learning process.

b. Professional data 1 and 2 show a difference in conclusions on CBC implementation evaluation. This indicates that it is actually an "agreement" that the evaluation has been performed. However, it is completely unknown to professional data 2 due to the absence of representation in following the CBC implementation evaluation process, the lack of transparency regarding CBC implementation evaluation, and in the evaluation process the industry and Competence experts are not involved so that it cannot produce a good decision on the evaluation of CBC implementation.

The implementation of CBC policy in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic has actually been running well. However, in practice, there are factors affecting the implementation, and these are very influential on the achievement of educational objectives as implied in the Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 12 of 2012 on Higher Education Article 5 and Article 6 and the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism Number 6 of 2017 on Competency-Based Curriculum of Higher Education Program under the Ministry of Tourism. This standard of competency assurance also becomes one of the references in analyzing the implementation of CBC policy. In this case, quality assurance covers the process as well as implications of the CBC policy implementation process.

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the results and discussion, it can be concluded that:

Competency-Based Curriculum Policy in Makassar Tourism Polytechnic is actually implemented well even though the result is not optimal. This is because the two factors, namely the supporting and inhibiting factors, are not taken into consideration. In principle, the basic consideration in formulating a policy and before implementing it is both factors. Factors inhibiting the implementation of competency-based curriculum policy include the lack of prior socialization on the implementation of the policy, especially the policy of the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism number 6 of 2017 on Competency-Based Curriculum. Another inhibiting factor is the absence of planning regarding the addition of human resources such as lecturers and teachers as well as administration staff. In addition, the lack of facilities and infrastructure and supporting facilities causes the competency-based curriculum policy to not be implemented optimally.

REFERENCES

- [1] Undang Undang Republik Indonesia nomor 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi
- [2] Peraturan Menteri Pariwisata Nomor 3 Tahun 2016 Tentang Satuta Politeknik Pariwisata Makassar
- [3] Edward III George Charles, Public Policy Implementation. (JAI Press editor, 1984)
- [4] Peraturan Menteri Pariwisata Republik Indonesia Nomor 6 Tahun 2017 Tentang Kurikulum Berbasis Kompetensi Program Pendidikan Tinggi di Lingkungan Kementerian Pariwisata
- [5] Undang-Undang Nomor 20 Tahun 2003 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional, Jakarta ; Sinar Grafika Offset.
- [6] Mulyasa,E, Kurikulum Berbasis Kompetensi: Konsep, Karakteristik dan Implementasi, Bandung (Remaja Rosdakarya, 2006)
- [7] Hamalik,O, Model- Model Pengembangan Kurikulum (Bandung: Pasca Sarjana UPI, 2000)
- [8] Freeman, R, Learning in Public Policy, In M. Moran, M. Rein, & R. E. Goodin, The Oxford Handbook of Public Policy (New York: Oxford University Press. 2006) 367
- [9] Mthethwa, R. M, Critical Dimensions for Policy Implementation., African Journal of Public Affairs, 5(2), 2012, 36-42.
- [10] Lintjewas, O., Tulusan, F., & Egetan, M, Evaluasi Kebijakan Pemberian Bantuan, 2016,
- [11] Wahab, S. A, Pengantar Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Negara (Jakarta: Center for Academic Publishing Service, 2010).
- [12] Juliarta, Edward, Model Implementasi Kebijakan Publik (Trio Rimba Persada, Jakarta, 2009)
- [13] Aziz. S.R.; Abdul, Memahami Fenomena Sosial Melalui Studi Kasus. Dalam : Bungin., Burhan. Analisis Data Penelitian Kualitatif. Pemahaman Filosofis dan Metodologis ke Arah Penguasaan Model Aplikasi.Jakarta :PT RajaGrafindo Persada, 2003)18-34
- [14] Moleong, Lexy J, Metodologi Penelitian, Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2007
- [15] Miles,Matthew B dan A.A.Michael Huberman 2007. Analisis Data Kualitatif. Jakarta. Universitas Indonesia Press

Wim Johannes Winowatan "Implementation of Competency-Based Curriculum Policy at Tourism Polytechnic of Makassar." IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS) , vol. 23, no. 2, 2018, pp. 30-36.