Measurement of Patient Satisfaction and Loyalty of Hospital Based Customer Relationship Management in Jember Indonesia

NurulQomariah
Department of Management, Economic Faculty, Muhammadiyah University of Jember

Abstract: This study aims to determine the effect of Customer Relationship Management (people, process and technology) to the satisfaction and loyalty of patients at Primary Clinic dr. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember. The population of this study were all patients treated at the Primary Clinic dr. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember. The sampling method is purposive sampling with the number of 100 patients. This research was conducted by spreading questionnaire to patients at Primary Clinic Dr. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember. The research method using multiple linear regression analysis. The results showed that clinical services, clinical care processes and clinical services technology influence on patient satisfaction. While patient satisfaction is also influenced by the loyalty of patients at the Clinic Primary dr. M. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember.

Keywords: Customer Relationship Management, Satisfaction, Loyality, Hospital.

I. Introduction

Competition is very sharp today has an impact on all business sectors. Given this competition the company is required to continuously improve performance. This performance improvement must be done so that the company can survive amid competition is very keen. In addition to survival, improved performance is also intended to give satisfaction to the customer or user services (Kusubagio et al. 2015). To be able to survive and win the competition in the era of globalization, then businesses are required to have a good strategy, so companies will have advantages over competitors. The strategy should also be implemented in a planned, systematic and long-term. In the implementation of a corporate strategy, performance measurement needs to be done, so that can know the success rate and the effect of applying the strategy for the company. Phenomenon of rapidly growing business world today pose increasing number of hospitals and health facilities other than hospitals. Hospitals and other healthcare facilities should be able to provide good service quality. Good quality services increase patient satisfaction with hospitals and other healthcare facilities. If patients are satisfied with the quality of service they received, the harmonious interpersonal relationships will be formed (Solikiah2008). Interpersonal relationship between patients and hospitals or other healthcare facilities that will encourage patients to use the services hospitals or health care facilities other so indirectly would increase the level of loyalty of patients to hospitals and other healthcare facilities (Estiningsih and Hariyanti, 2013).

Since the government implemented a program of Social Security Agency (BPJS) Health in 2012, the development of health facilities that utilize BPJS increasing. The development of the healthcare facility also increased. In Jember there are about 8 clinics that facilitate patient with BPJS Health program. Primary clinics scattered in Jember include: Clinical Camar, Clinical Bina Sehat, Clinical Harapan Bersama, Clinical Doktor Kulkun Taman Gading, Clinical Kimia Farma, Clinical dr. M. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember, Clinical IBI. Competition in the business world in the field of health is also a concern of the leadership of the hospital or health care facilities is no exception primary clinical health facilities. Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember is also a clinic that facilitates patients with health BPJS program. In the face of increasing competition, the Primary Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember need to increase customer satisfaction and loyalty.

Customer satisfaction is the level of one’s feelings after comparing the performance compared with expectations (Kotler, 2007). So customer satisfaction is a situation where the desire, expectation and customer needs can be met. A service is considered satisfactory if the service can meet the needs and expectations of customers. Customer satisfaction measurement is an important element in providing better services, more efficient and more effective (Qomariah, 2012). For Primary Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember, service user satisfaction need to be considered, because of the existence of the service user is very important for the sustainability of healthcare organizations in the future. There are four methods to identify customer satisfaction, namely: 1) The system of complaints and suggestions: an organization that serves the customer provides ample opportunity to its customers to submit suggestions and complaints, for example, provide a suggestion box, 2) Ghost shopping: one way to gain an overview regarding customer satisfaction is by hiring some people to play a role or act as potential buyers of the company’s products and competitors, 3) Lost customer analysis; Companies should contact customers who have stopped buying in order to understand why it
happened, 4) customer satisfaction survey: starting the survey company will obtain responses and feedback indirectly from customers and also give a positive sign that companies pay attention to the customers (Kotler, 2007). In addition to customer satisfaction, the company also needs to pay attention to customer loyalty. Customer loyalty is very important in an era of intense competition as it is now. Customer loyalty is customer commitment to a brand, product or service based on a positive attitude that is reflected in the consistent purchase (Estiningsih and Hariyanti, 2013). According Kotler and Keller (2008), customer loyalty can be measured by three things: say positive things are said positive things about the product; recommended friends are recommending a product that has been consumed to a friend; continue purchasing is purchasing is done continuously to the product that has been consumed. Maintaining patient and build patient loyalty is the goal of the CRM program to all organizations. It required a customer relationship management system that is effective is to develop a customer-focused activities, with the support of human resources and quality services. By focusing on the customer, it means the company is ready to perform the service process from the perspective of the customer, can feel the desires, needs and expectations of the customers. If the company is able to understand its customers and provide satisfaction, confidence, so that the customer wants to talk positively about the company to other users, then the program has made the last customer (Sari, 2009).

There are several factors that can affect customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Customer relationship management is a factor expected to affect customer satisfaction and loyalty. Customer relationship management is the marketing activities that attract, retain and enhance relationships with customers (Kotler, 2007). Winner (2001) defines customer relationship marketing as a strategy to build a good relationship with the customers in the long term by combining the ability to respond immediately and to serve customers with high interaction. By maintaining good relations with customers is expected customers will be satisfied and they would recommend the good things about the company. Research on the relationship between customer relationship management and customer satisfaction has been done. Estiningsih and Hariyanti (2013) states that the variable CRM is comprised of people, processes and technology have a positive impact on loyalty pregnant women at Hermina Hospital TangkubanPerahu Malang. Putri (2012) states that the variable CRM consisting of attentive staff, the comfort of the treatment process and medical devices provide a positive impact on patient satisfaction and loyalty. While a doctor's attention does not affect the patient's satisfaction. Patient satisfaction effect on loyalty and image. Sabang et al. (2013) stated that the focus on the patient did not significantly influence patient satisfaction. HR competencies significantly affect patient satisfaction and quality of hospital services significantly influence patient satisfaction. While patient satisfaction is significantly influence patient loyalty. Sari (2009) states that customer relationship management has an influence on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty.

II. Theoretical Framework And Hypothesis

Services are activities, benefits and satisfaction are offered for sale (Tjiptono, 2007). The fundamental difference between the goods and services difficult to be done, because the purchase of certain goods is often accompanied with specific services such as installation or warranty for repairs, and purchase services are often also included items which equip such as eating in a restaurant. Kotler and Keller (2006) defines the services are as any act or acts that can be offered by one party to another that is essentially intangible and does not produce physical possession of something. Lovelock and Wirtz (2004) defines a service as an activity or performance offered by one party to the other, although the process may be tied to a physical product, the performance often does not look natural, and does not normally result in ownership of all factors of production. Services are economic activities that create value and provide benefits to customers in a specific time and place to enhance a desired changes.

Kotler (2007) states that customer satisfaction is the level of one's feelings after comparing the performance compared with expectations. So customer satisfaction is a situation where the desire, expectation and customer needs can be met. A service is considered satisfactory if the service can meet the needs and expectations of customers. Customer satisfaction measurement is an important element in providing better services, more efficient and more effective. If the customer was not satisfied with a service that is provided, these services can be ascertained ineffective and inefficient. This especially important in the public service. The level of customer satisfaction with the services is an important factor in developing a service delivery system that is responsive to the needs of customers, minimize costs and time and maximize the impact of services to the target population.

The foundation for the development of Customer Relationship Management is generally considered the relationship marketing (relationship marketing), which is defined as marketing activities to attract, retain and improve customer relationships. Grönroos (1990) argues the importance of the relationship in the context of marketing. He proposes a definition of marketing is to build, maintain and enhance relationships with customers and other consumers, so that the objectives of the parties involved fulfilled. Winner (2001) defines customer relationship marketing as a strategy to build a good relationship with the customers in the long term by

DOI: 10.9790/487X-1806015560 www.iosrjournals.org 56 | Page
combining the ability to respond immediately and to serve customers with high interaction. To support the implementation of customer relationship marketing strategy, we need a device such as the management approach, ie Customer Relationship Management (CRM). Efforts to foster customer loyalty can be done with some marketing strategies, one of which is the Customer Relationship Management (CRM). According to Kotler and Keller (2009), CRM or customer relationship management is the process of managing detailed information about each customer. CRM manages all "points of contact" customers to maximize customer loyalty. Customer contact points are all instances where customers contact with the product or services, from personal experience, mass communication to ordinary observation (Kotler & Keller, 2008). CRM Implementation establish good communication with customers so as to respond to the desires and needs of the customer (Imasari and Nursalin, 2011). From the description are then able to develop a research hypothesis. The first hypothesis that health care workers influence on patient satisfaction. A second hypothesis is the process variables affect the service to client satisfaction. And the third hypothesis is the variable of technology services effect to client satisfaction. While the fourth hypothesis is patient satisfaction effect to patient loyalty.

III. Research Methods

This type of research is a kind of explanatory research. This study intends to explain the influence between variables through hypothesis testing and at the same explanations to some variable (Sugiyono, 2010). In accordance with the purpose of research is to analyze, test and confirm the effect of CRM (people, process and technology) to the patient's satisfaction and loyalty. Research to collect the necessary data, both primary data and secondary data held in the Primary Clinic dr. M. SuhermanMuhammadiyah University of Jember. The research object is a patient ever treated at the Primary Clinic dr. M. SuhermanMuhammadiyah University of Jember.

The population in this study were patients who had been treated at the Primary Clinic dr. M. SuhermanMuhammadiyah University of Jember. Sugiono (2007) states that a sample size of at least 5 times the existing indicators. The sampling technique used in this research is purposive sampling. Criteria used in the sampling of respondents had never went to the Primary Clinic dr. SuhermanMuhammadiyah University of Jember. Used as a sample of 100 respondents. The total sample of 100 respondents is in accordance with the criteria of samples stated Sugiono (2007).

The independent variables in this study are the variables customer relationship management comprising a) clinicians, b) the service process, c) technology services. According Estiningsih and Hariyanti (2013), CRM has three main interrelated aspects, namely:

a. Officers of Health Services
   Health Services Officer is an employee as implementing CRM. Human dimension, a key factor that must be considered include the abilities, skills, and hospitality.

b. Health Care Process
   Namely service process systems and procedures that help people to better identify and establish close relationships with customers. Dimension process services include communications with customers, providing value-added, customer complaint handling.

c. Technology Services
   Technology helps accelerate and optimize human factors and business processes in customer relationship management activities. The technological dimension is formed as indicators of customer database system and communication media used to establish relationships with customers.

The dependent variable in this study is customer satisfaction and loyalty. Customer satisfaction is defined as the value of a customer or a feeling that comes from a comparison between the impression of the performance of services in the field of health. The indicators used to measure are (Kotler, 2006) as follows:

a. Satisfied with the clinical facilities.
b. Satisfied with the services the clinic employee.
c. Satisfied with the information technology used clinic

The second the dependent variable is patient loyalty. Patient loyalty is defined as the act of loyalty with commitment. Items loyalty is taken of the size of Behavioural Intention (Zeithaml, Berry and Parasuraman: 1996) consisting of:

a. Provide positive information about clinical services dr. SuhermanMuhammadiyah University of Jember in others.
b. Recommend clinic dr. SuhermanMuhammadiyah University of Jember to someone who needs information.
c. Encourage friends, relatives and people close to go to the clinic dr. SuhermanMuhammadiyah University of Jember.
Content validity of the test carried out to determine the extent of a measuring tool (questionnaire) can measure the required information. Test the validity of the data can be done by calculating the correlation between the scores of each of the questions with a total score of (Solimun, 2007). Reliability test indicates the extent to which a measuring tool (questionnaire) can give different results if the measurements were taken back to the same subject at different times. Measurements were performed by measuring the correlation between the results of answers to the question that is put on the measuring facility reliability with Cronbach Alpha statistical test. To determine the effect of variable CRM on customer satisfaction and loyalty, then used the Multiple Linear Regression Analysis (Sekaran 2006). Multicollinearity occurs when one of the independent variables occurs correlation with other variables. To see happen multicollinenriety or can not be seen from (1) the value of tolerance and the opponent (2) VIF (Variance Inflation Factor). Ghozali (2002) suggests that commonly used cutoff value is 0.10 or tolerance value equal to the value of VIF above 10.

Heteroskedasticity test used to determine whether errors bullies have the same variant. Testing is done by looking at the graph plot between the predicted value of the dependent variable (ZPRED) with residual value (SRESID). Detection of the presence or absence heteroscedasticity can be done by looking at whether there is a specific pattern on the graph scatterplot between SRESID and ZPRED where the axis Y is Y had been predicted, and the X axis is the residual (Y prediction - Y actually) that has been studentized (Ghozali, 2002). Basic analysis, if there are certain patterns, such as dots that no particular form regular patterns (wavy, widened and then narrowed), then the indicate has occurred heteroskedasticity. If there is no clear pattern, as well as the points spread above and below the number 0 on the Y axis, then there is no heteroscedasticity. Normality test aims to test whether the regression model, the dependent variable and independent variables both have normal distribution or not. A good regression model is to have a data distribution normal or nearly normal. One way to see the normality is viewed histograms comparing the observation data distribution approaches a normal distribution. Another method is to look at normal probability plots comparing the cumulative distribution of the normal distribution (Ghozali, 2002).

IV. Results And Discussion

Classification of respondents in the Primary Clinic dr. SuhermanMuhammad University Jember by gender consists of 65 women and 35 men. Classification of respondents in the Primary Clinic dr. SuhermanMuhammad University Jember as respondents by age of respondents note that the respondents according to age consists of ages less than 20 years total 15 patients, aged between 20 years to 40 years was 48 patients and age above 40 years amounted to 37 patients. based questionnaire distributed. Classification of respondents in the Primary Clinic dr. SuhermanMuhammad University Jember as respondents according to the type of work it is known that the respondents according to the work consists of PNS were 10 patients, 55 patients amounted Private and state enterprises amounted to 13 patients and students was 22. From the results of test validity and reliability can be seen that the validity of the test results showed that all the measuring instruments used in this study is valid, it is because the value of r count larger than the recommended value of r (corrected Item-Total Correlation) that is equal to 0.3. To test reliability in this study also shows reliable results for all measuring instruments. This is indicated by Cronbach alpha values for all variables is greater than the value required Cronbach alpha is equal to 0.6.

The test results assuming multikolinierity where Y1 (patient satisfaction) as the dependent variable showed that the tolerance value calculation results showed no independent variables that have a value tolerance of less than 10%, which means there is no correlation between the independent variable whose value is more than 90%. VIF value calculation results also showed no one independent variable which has VIF value of more than 10. It can be concluded that there is no multicollinearitiy between independent variables in the regression model. The test results assuming multikolinierity where Y2 (patient loyalty) as the dependent variable showed no independent variables that have a value tolerance of less than 10%, which means there is no correlation between the independent variable whose value is more than 90%. Heteroskedasticity test results showed that the dots randomly spread and spread both above and below the number 0 on the Y axis It can be concluded that there is no heteroscedasticity in regression models, so the regression model is used to predict feasible patient satisfaction. The test results heteroskedasticity with loyalty variables as dependent variable showed that the dots randomly spread and spread both above and below the number 0 on the Y axis It can be concluded that there is no heteroscedasticity in regression models, so the regression model is used to predict worthy patient loyalty.

Normality assumption test with the dependent variable Y1 (Patient Satisfaction) indicate that the points spread around the diagonal line, and its distribution follows the direction of the diagonal line, so it can be said that the regression model unfit due to meet the assumptions of normality. Normality assumption test with the dependent variable Y2 (Loyalty Patient) shows that the points spread around the diagonal line, and its distribution follows the direction of the diagonal line, so it can be said that the regression model unfit due to meet the assumptions of normality.
The results showed that the level of significance of F count which amounted to 35 975 is 0.00 less than 0.05. This shows that independent variables consisting of service personnel, service process, and technology services have a positive impact on patient satisfaction. From the results of the partial test shows that the variable-care workers has a coefficient of -0.263 with a significance level of 0.040. The test results indicate that the hypothesis that says service personnel have effect on patient satisfaction Clinic dr. Suherman UM Jember is accepted. Based on these results by testing multiple linear regression analysis, then in order to improve patient satisfaction service personnel should continue to provide good service to patients who went to the Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember. The results are consistent with research conducted by Putri (2012), Estiningsih and Hariyanti (2013) and Sabang et al. (2013).

The results showed that the level of significance of F count which amounted to 35 975 is 0.00 less than 0.05. These results indicate that the independent variables consist of service personnel, service process, and technology services have a positive impact on patient satisfaction. From the results of the partial test shows that the variable-care workers has a coefficient of -0.226 with a significance level of 0.010. The test results show that the process of health care affect the patient's satisfaction at the Clinic dr. UM Suherman Jember. Therefore Clinic dr. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember should continue to improve patient satisfaction through the improvement of health care processes. The results are consistent with research conducted by Sari (2009), Putri (2012), Estiningsih and Hariyanti (2013) and Sabang et al. (2013).

The results showed that the level of significance of F count which amounted to 35 975 is 0.00 less than 0.05. This suggests that the independent variables consist of service personnel, service process, and technology services have a positive impact on patient satisfaction simultaneously. The results of the partial test shows that the variable service technology has a coefficient of 0.433 with a significance level of 0.000. These test results show that the technology services affect the satisfaction of patients at the Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember. The results showed that service technology affect the patient's satisfaction. Therefore Clinic dr. M Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember must continue to improve health technology owned and also follow the development of the existing technology. The results are consistent with research conducted by Putri (2012) and Estiningsih and Hariyanti (2013).

The results showed that the level of significance of F count which amounted to 18 514 is $ 0.00 less than 0.05. This suggests that the independent variables consist of patient satisfaction has a positive impact on patient loyalty simultaneously. Partial test results showed that the variables of patient satisfaction has a coefficient of 0.427 with a significance level of 0.000. From the results of this test showed that patient satisfaction effect on patient loyalty to the Clinic dr. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember. Therefore Clinic dr. M Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember must continue to improve the level of patient satisfaction in order to increase patient loyalty. The results are consistent with research conducted by the Putri (2012) and Sabang et al. (2013).

V. Conclusions, Suggestion, And Limitations

Conclusion

1. Officers clinical services affect the satisfaction of patients at the Clinic Primary dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember. This means that the services provided by the existing clinical services officer at the Clinic Primary dr. M. Suherman UM Jember able to give satisfaction to the patient.

2. The process of clinical services affect the satisfaction of patients at the Clinic Primary dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember. This means that the existing services at the Clinic Primary dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jemberable to give satisfaction to the patient.

3. Technology clinical services affect the satisfaction of patients at the Clinic Primary dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember. This means that the technology services owned dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember Primary Clinic able to give satisfaction to the patient.

4. Patient satisfaction effect on patient loyalty on the Primary Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember. This means that the satisfaction felt by the patient at the Primary Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jemberable to make the patient to a treatment at the clinic.

Suggestion

Primary Leadership Clinic dr. M. Suherman Muhammad Maimuni University of Jember should continue to pay attention to and improve the satisfaction and loyalty of patients at his clinic since proven to improve patient satisfaction and loyalty.

Research limitations

Factors that affect patient satisfaction only factors include concierge service, service process and technology services. The steps in this research has been conducted in accordance with established procedures, but there are still limitations in conducting research. Some limitations of the study include:

DOI: 10.9790/487X-1806015560  www.iosrjournals.org  59 | Page
1. This study only examines the factors of service personnel, service process and technology services and patient satisfaction and patient loyalty that still need to be reviewed by subsequent researchers on external factors such as trust and customer value, and so forth.

2. The data used in this study is data seconds or cross section data, so it cannot be used to generalize the results.

3. The object of this research is only the Clinic dr. M Suherman Muhammadiyah University of Jember.

References


